

IMPLICATIONS OF VATTIMO'S *VERWINDUNG* OF MODERNISM IN ARCHITECTURAL THEORY

A B S T R A C T

In the postmodern era, besides new approaches to architectural practice, substantial changes happen in architectural textual production owed to the inflow of the postmodern transdisciplinary theory in architectural discourse. Theorists, critics and historians of architecture gladly use the contribution from philosophy, political sciences, sociology, art theory and literary criticism to categorize and explain postmodern architectural styles or tendencies, no longer unifying them exclusively by means of formalistic aspects dating from the same period. Now, topics and paradigms from various postmodern theories are being implemented and thus created the phenomenon of the translation of a theory into an instrument of architectural purpose. In most cases, theoretical outlooks serve as a cover which the theorists of architecture use to formulate the poetics of architects, proclaim desirable models of reception, and develop the stance on the disciplinary and socio-historical contexts. However, it becomes interesting when the same architectural works of a single or several architects are differently interpreted by different theorists of architecture. The paper examines these premises on a specific example, which is: 1) demonstrated in practice by Catalan architecture of the 1980s; 2) the point of convergence between de Solà-Morales, Rossi and Frampton; 3) underlain by Vattimo's philosophical concept of *Verwindung* of modernism.

Vladimir Stevanović

Singidunum University, Faculty of Media and Communications

KEY WORDS

VERWINDUNG

WEAK THOUGHT

CATALAN ARCHITECTURE

MODERNISM

POSTMODERNISM

FUNDAMENTALISM

CRITICAL REGIONALISM

FRAGMENTARINESS

INTRODUCTION:

WEAK THOUGHT, *VERWINDUNG* AND DECORATIVE

In order to explain more closely the meaning of the term *Verwindung*, it is first necessary to briefly sketch out the primary elements of Vattimo's philosophy, better known as the weak thought (*il pensiero debole*).¹ The weak thought is one of the postmodern proposals of how to practice philosophy, which starts from the critique of the monolithic and authoritative Western Modernity and universalist pretensions founded of the reign of reason. Throughout the modern age different approaches interchange, but what unifies them is the metaphysical monism and absolutism, irrespective of whether they are scientific evidence in positivism, correct ideology in marxism, the thing itself in phenomenology or fixed and enclosed system of meaning in structuralism. Because of these solid properties Vattimo identifies modernity with metaphysics, making the postmodern thinking postmetaphysical at the same time. Following the conclusion that the stable reference point typical of the metaphysical modernity has been lost for good, the mission of the weak thought becomes to try to establish a theoretical categorization of the world without ultimately and normatively founding the thought as such. In the wake of Nietzsche, Heidegger and Gadamer, Vattimo defines the end of the modernity/metaphysics as the peak of the nihilistic process in which the absolutization of ontological andgnoseological categories (before anything else of Being and truth) dissolves and weakens towards their understanding as hermeneutical, *i.e.*, interpretive and rhetorical events in the domain of the socio-historical horizon. As opposed to the strong metaphysical thought, self-elevated to the level of the only possible thinking, the weak thought conscientiously recognizes, accepts and admits that it is nothing more than a product of the individual, fragmentary and heterogeneous time.

One of the central points of the weak thought is *Verwindung* – a specific way of relating, taking a stance toward what still is or what may be modern in the newly created postmodern conditions. *Verwindung* is a term Vattimo takes from Heidegger and uses as a backbone of his critique of the modern concept of linear history reigned by the ideals of progressive development and critical overcoming of previous states only to move on to the next phase which would once again be founded on a monistic principle. According to Vattimo, modernism is permeated by the idea of the history of thought as a progressive knowledge, developed on the basis of an every time fuller foundation – the origin, which makes theoretical and practical revolutions in Western history appear and be identified as recoveries, rebirths and returns.² In this kind of

a constellation, the new identifies with the value of reappropriating the primordial or the authentic origin. For this reason postmodernity cannot be defined as a new, more true alternative to modernity, for then it would remain the prisoner of that modern system of critical overcoming and progressive interchanging of paradigms directed towards a new foundation. Postmodernity cannot be produced as a novelty, nor is it possible to return to a new start by appropriating some desirable origin. On the contrary, Vattimo refers to Heidegger's way of overcoming metaphysics which is underlined by the nuances between two German words signifying overcoming and surpassing: 1) *Überwindung* – overcoming which supposes *Aufhebung*, abandonment, leaving something behind in the spirit of Hegelian-Marxist dialectic tradition; 2) *Verwindung* – impertinent, twisted, distorted way of overcoming which contains elements of recognizing belonging to something, acceptance and deepening of that.³ In the translation into Italian, to *Verwindung* Vattimo adds meanings aggregated in the verb *rimettersi*: rely on someone, get something back (e.g., get a message back) and recover (as from an illness). The main instrument of *Verwindung* is *An-denken* – a reminding thought or remembrance, which allows connecting with the tradition, re-memorizing and re-appropriating possibilities and values that belong to spiritual forms of the past. For Heidegger metaphysics is a predestination and historical destination from where messages are being transmitted; messages that we keep and keep reusing. As Vattimo puts it in the spirit of hermeneutical tradition of handing down: this kind of a predestined world we are thrown in is constructed by a series of echoes, linguistic responses and messages coming from the past and from others (others alongside us as well as other cultures).⁴ *Verwindung* of metaphysics indicates accepting the necessity to think in metaphysical categories tradition had passed on to us, but without those most metaphysical aspects concerning monism, foundation, universalism, critical overcoming and so on. If one cannot step out of the metaphysical tradition, they can act in a *verwunden* relation to it, going for reconciliation and ironic acceptance. Postmetaphysical thinking keeps metaphysical concepts, passing them on as heirlooms. This, however, is not a static action; rather, weak thought interprets them within the contemporary context, which supposes twisting and distortion of their original meaning. In terms of modernity and postmodernity, this means that postmodern thinking brings with itself rewriting, testing, re-thinking from a different perspective, twisting and redefining the traces of modernity. For Vattimo, that main question of the postmodernity is not where to move on, but from where to move on.

In the weak thought art has a special place, because it represents a suitable model for postmodern aesthetic experience. After dissolving and eliminating strong universal values in the postmodernity, arts are left in a circumstance that was formerly, in metaphysical terms, understood as peripheral. Given the inexistence of a strong center towards which essential artistic criteria would gravitate, it becomes impossible to distinguish what essential is. What remains is the possibility to accept all in a work of art as inessential or – peripheral. In accordance with these premises, already in part set by Gadamer, Vattimo accepts the peripheral meaning of art and develops it in terms of ornament, *i.e.*, decoration.⁵ Once freed from its essence or foundation, ornament becomes like an accessory – a sort of superfluous expression that does not require an attentive reading and is not the subject of major attention, because it emerges from the periphery. In this constellation, for Vattimo *aisthesis* does not only suppose a sensory experience, a subjective emotion or feeling, but the best type of experience in which the truth cannot be reduced to the reason or to a scientific fact. Art is the place where the truth is expressed weakly, by being dispersed across interpretive horizons, becoming eventual and contingent.

CATALAN POSTMODERN ARCHITECTURE (1986)

Not long after Vattimo had come forward with his weak thought, *Vervindung* of modernism, indeed implicitly, appeared in the theory of architecture, in Catalan theorist Ignasi de Solà-Morales. In his book *Architettura minimale a Barcelona: costruire sulla città costruita* (hereinafter *Architettura minimale*)⁶ he summarizes the work of several postmodern Catalan architects and teams (Josep Lluís Mateo, Jordi Garcés & Enric Sòria, Martínez Lapena & Elias Torres, Albert Viaplana & Helio Piñon, Jaime Bach & Gabriel Mora and Josep-Antoni Llinàs) from the first half of the 1980s. These projects, which nurture an ambivalent relationship with modernism, emerged as a part of a city reconstruction headed by Oriol Bohigas, at the time of enthusiasm for a new democracy, shortly after Franco's dictatorship in Spain had ended and immediately before the Olympic fever in Barcelona.⁷ Even though here de Solà-Morales does not yet make reference to Vattimo's weak thought, there is evidence to theorization of decorativeness as a mode in which to carry out the reception of the architecture he speaks of, while a hint of *Verwindung* can be felt in a relationship between modernism and postmodernism in the sense of accepting certain formal, poetic, but also cultural and technological aspects.

According to de Solà-Morales, the morphology of Barcelonian architecture is founded on an eclectic concept, which in itself combines: 1) traces of loyalty to the local modern tradition of the 1950s and 1960s (Josep Antoni Coderch, Josep M. Sostres, Bohigas); 2) assimilations into typo-morphological analyses of the Italian neo-rationalist Aldo Rossi which is here, specific for showing scanty enthusiasm for classical and metaphysical austerity of Rossi's poetics.⁸ On one hand, this is an inclusive, equivocal and eclectic architecture, completely in the spirit of postmodern time, because it is created through combinations, juxtapositions, superpositions, collaging and quoting of different fragments. Nevertheless, as opposed to the postmodern figurative-narrative eclecticism which he discredits, de Solà-Morales speaks of an eclectic taste for the modernity. De Solà-Morales here does not use the term *Verwindung*, but it is clear that he talks about fragments of modernism which are *verwunden*. On the other hand, even though admitting of his affinity towards the modernity, de Solà-Morales stresses that Catalan architecture does not yearn for modern high technology. Intellectualism, utopian speculation, improved technology – are all those stable and progressive modernist points concerning which de Solà-Morales claims had never existed as a part of Catalan modernist architectural culture. Between postmodern representation and modern technology, Catalan architecture opts for a hedonistic attitude towards form, which de Solà-Morales supports using the term *decorum*, pointing to the problems previously discussed by Vattimo. Decoration is not synonymous with kitsch and adoration; rather, it is a readiness to accentuate secondary-minor, complementary gestures, ordinary elements and details which allow for a sensual pleasure. This is a conception of the use and perception of the building that does not arise intellectually, as a rational gratification of our perception, but as a stirring of the senses that finds the principal source of its satisfaction in the development of the perceptual experience.⁹ It is from this point that de Solà-Morales derives his model of reception, which, according to his opinion, is suitable for Catalan architecture, away from the rational constructs of conceptual and intellectual thought and set into the realm of visceral understanding, which is a response to previously shown Vattimo's concern for the peripheral status of arts and aesthetic experience, which conforms to it as such.

WEAK ARCHITECTURE (1987)

The book *Architettura minimale* will remain in the shadow of de Solà-Morales's far better known text titled *Arquitectura débil*, in which he will continue to use the concepts of *Verwindung* of modernism and the decorative, although this time he will make reference to Vattimo's weak thought. In fact,

the very title “weak architecture” pretends to be the official translation of the weak thought from philosophy into the theory of architecture. In this text de Solà-Morales places Vattimo's end of modernity into the architectural context immediately following the crisis of high modernism during the 1960s. Having concluded that this crisis was the result of the breakdown of the enclosed, rational system which in vane pretended to absolute applicability, he moves on to analyze postmodern architectural possibilities. Clearly oriented against the vulgar postmodernism as the populist architecture of superfluous rhetoric, which he does not even consider a serious option, he in turn examines the adequacy of other architectural ways that have led from modernity to postmodernity: European neo-rationalism, American neo-avantgarde (group of architects called *NY5*) and critical regionalism, which he then evaluates, in some places, exactly through the prism of *Verwindung* of modernism. These are the tendencies, which according to their interpreters lay both outside the functionalist-technologized and bureaucratic-commercialized modernism and outside the main currents of the stylistic postmodernism.

In the poetic stances taken by the protagonists of neo-rationalism and neo-avantgarde de Solà-Morales recognizes fundamentalism – relapse of a desire for orthodox and correct guidelines, which would lead towards a return to the roots of modernism and as such allow them to stand in front of postmodern heterogeneous time. Given that this kind of fundamentalism is the *corpus delicti* of the thinking, which by revealing its monistic position, remains confined by the boundaries of modern-metaphysical global system logic, for someone who thinks in terms of the weak thought rejection is expected. Postmodern fundamentalism is: 1) founded on a structuralist theoretical model as an autonomous, exclusive and authentic way of architectural practice, in which the application of the enclosed typological analysis is expected to provide confirmation of universal and everlasting architectural rules, without leaving the possibilities for any other approach; 2) oriented towards a new reappropriation of origin, in this case, primordial and lost ideas of modern tradition, which are concentrated in the enlightened architecture of the XVIII century and in the purism of the modern movement of the 1920s. According to de Solà-Morales, these attempts are nothing more than a nostalgia for an alleged truth of modernism and that is why they stay in the domain of apologetic formalism and superfluous historicism.

Another postmodern tendency de Solà-Morales rejects is Frampton's critical regionalism. Frampton also elaborates the critical concept of architectural autonomy, but unlike Rossi and the *NY5*, he does not take on the structuralist

model, but a syncretic combination of Theodor Adorno's neo-marxism and Clement Greenberg's aesthetics of high modernism. For Frampton tectonics is that autonomous, essential element inherent to architecture, just like typology is for Rossi's successors. Tectonics is the mode in which the poetics of construction is manifested in gravitational properties of joint, frame and mass, where an act of making comes into presence in ontological terms. In that sense, tectonics distinguishes critical regionalism from the technological solutions of high modernism and scenographic facades of stylistic postmodernism. Although critical of modernism, the position of critical regionalism in terms of form still stays faithful to the progressive aspects of modern puristic legacy. Architects who, according to Frampton, achieve tectonic qualities in their architectural work, do so by using an abstract modernist vocabulary of form. As is known, critical regionalism appropriates most of European neo-rationalists (mostly those coming from the Swiss canton of Ticino), followed by the well known architects such as Tadao Ando and Álvaro Siza, but also a number of Catalan architects such as Sostres, Bohigas and Coderch. However, for de Solà-Morales tectonics is just another relapse of the classic conception of architecture insinuating Vitruvius's *firmitas*, *i.e.*, firmness. As opposed to this, he affirms the loss of tectonics, giving several examples from the fields of art and architecture (Richard Serra, Josep Maria Jujol, Konstantin Melnikov, Josef Hoffman, Marcel Duchamp and Walter Pichler), which express the weak, fragile and temporal side. The sculpture *Equal* by the American post-minimalist Serra in de Solà-Morales's words represents a trodimensional language that reflects a conception of the artwork parallel to what he has labeled weak architecture. This is the instance of the surfaces which are in juxtaposition and are superimposed, which almost touch one another without melding.¹⁰

The next aspect of critical regionalism stands up against universalist pretensions of high modernism for the sake of regional concern for place and topography and for poetic dwelling. Frampton here relies on the *strong* reading of Heidegger from his late phenomenological phase.¹¹ In addition to poetic and contextual aspects taken from Heidegger's phenomenology of place, Frampton advocates haptic, corporal and tactile experience of architecture relatable to the phenomenology of body in Merleau-Ponty. By referring to Massimo Cacciari,¹² de Solà-Morales questions Frampton's naive faith in a past order in which building, dwelling, and thinking were considered a unity, which as such allows poetic dwelling. He saw Frampton's putting to work these Heidegger's categories as merely attempts at restoring an old historical and rural order that has little or no sense in the context of contemporary urban and metropolitan crisis. After all, it has become sort of a mainstream to have Heidegger's

successors *a priori* discredited for their traditionalist, fervent concern for place and vernacular values at the expense of other architectural concerns, as well as for the *blood and soil* consequences of Heidegger's philosophy.¹³

On the basis of the tendencies he rejected, it is clear that de Solà-Morales wishes to conceive the weak architecture as *the fourth* way (not as stylistic postmodernism, not as fundamentalism, not as critical regionalism) by which architecture could pass from modernism to postmodernism. In his opinion, weak architecture is the architecture of small gestures which creates a great impact precisely owing to its weaknesses – fragile, ephemeral, non-aggressive, non-violent and tangential nature. In addition, this is a fragmentary architecture created in a free play of different parts, clippings gathered from modernism, and through their collecting, overlapping, convergence, divergence in the processes of juxtaposition and superposition.

These are all recognizable theses, even identical imperative models of *Verwindung* of modernism by means of which de Solà-Morales a year earlier had already described and explained Catalan postmodern architecture. On top of that, in *Arquitectura débil* de Solà-Morales will once again put to work and elaborate in more detail the model of reception he previously elaborated in *Architettura minimale* in terms of *decorum*. In de Solà-Morales's words, by accepting a certain level of weakness, weak architecture is conscientiously pulling back to the background. In this way, weak architecture is always *decorative*, for it elegantly and without a wish to dominate accentuates and enriches the existing reality by means of superficial and peripheral – decorative properties.¹⁴ These are the exact reasons why the aesthetic experience is a suitable model for a weak construction of the truth and reality. Given that the aesthetic experience in postmodernity no longer has a foundation, does not set standards and is far removed from any pretensions to the totality of the ontological system, it is, as such, compatible with the peripheral status of weak architecture. In this kind of a setting, *Architettura minimale* shows itself as a palimpsest for *Arquitectura débil*: both Catalan and weak architecture consist of arbitrary, eclectic fragments of modernism, and they are intended for a direct, synesthetic and visceral, and not exclusively rational experience.

WHO ARE ACTUALLY WEAK ARCHITECTS?

The problem with *Arquitectura débil* pointed out by Michael Hays is that de Solà-Morales does not specify the architecture that qualifies as weak.¹⁵ Judging from this claim, it is most likely that Hays did not have in his possession

Architettura minimale while reading *Arquitectura débil*, for otherwise he would have found himself able to recognize the initial context of weak architecture, conceived in the example of Catalan architecture. It also seems that Hays had not read the original version of the article *Arquitectura débil* published in *Quaderns*, which contains several pages that have been left out of the numerous reprints,¹⁶ and in which de Solà-Morales refers to the already mentioned Jujol, Melnikov, Hoffman, and Pichler as examples of weak architecture in practice. However, Hays is trying to shed light on and explain the concept of weak architecture by putting specific examples to work. He notices that even before 1980, there existed an architecture that was capable of producing a concept of weak thought, though we could not have called it that then. In some fragmentary architectural work of smaller scale, such as Frank Gehry's home in Santa Monica, Rafael Moneo's town hall in Logroño, Siza's bank buildings and apartment houses in Basel by Diener & Diener, Hays has sensed that weak attitude towards modernism. Analyzing these projects through *Verwindung* of modernism, Hays recognized a keeping-in-mind of the modernist tradition, a willingness to traverse it once again, but not to return uncritically to its heroism. Instead of heroism as the fundament of modernism, he sees the use of modernist compositional principles with acceptance of the aleatory relation that architecture has with the physical and social context of the city, whose disjunctions and contradictions are inscribed materially in all of this examples. As Hays concludes, weak architecture dispels, distorts and dissolves modernism's confidence and facilitates a sort of convalescence in the fragmentary.

De Solà-Morales would of course agree with Hays' classification of potential weak architects, since the *verwindened* presence of modernism in their formal and poetical choices does not deviate from the principles set out in *Arquitectura débil* and *Architettura minimale*. What is more, he has already agreed with Hays by assigning weakness as typical of Siza's, Gehry's and even Ando's work.¹⁷ Given that there is no space to detail Hays' lapses, this selection of weak architects leads us to the point. A comparative analysis has shown that (1) in *Architettura minimale* and *Arquitectura débil* de Solà-Morales uses the same theory, *i.e.*, the same interpretive models of weak thought (especially *Verwindung* and *decorum*) over which he establishes a relation with the other postmodern architectural tendencies, but (2) the difference in the examples of architectural practices pre- or post-positioned to this theory is particularly interesting, because (3) *Architettura minimale* had represented a limited domain of Catalan architecture, while in *Arquitectura débil* weakness becomes the description of an international architectural panorama.

CRITICAL REGIONALISM VS CRITICAL INTERNATIONALISM

The main question is: Does the reason for de Solà-Morales's rejection of postmodern fundamentalism and critical regionalism lie exclusively in their theoretical incompatibility with the *Verwindung* of modernism and with the postulates of weak thought in general? What if the very desire for defining the position of Catalan architecture of the 1980s compared to the leading architectural tendencies of that time was actually the central place in de Solà-Morales' appropriation of weak thought? In order to be theoretically constituted, promoted and maintained, an architectural tendency needs to be provided with a recognizable identity, which is an imperative de Solà-Morales was aware of. This is a place where the benefits of the postmodern theory enter the scene. Underlining theoretical differences from the *others* is used as defence against assimilation of Catalan architecture into the discourses of the other postmodern tendencies.

As is known, together with Ticino's architecture, throughout the 1980s Catalan architecture was often understood as a satellite of the Italian neo-rationalism, which comes as no surprise given the fact that the formalistic aspects of Catalan architecture have some of Rossi's touches. This is something that not even de Solà-Morales denied, but also he never forgot to reject mental and speculative foundation of Rossi's reconsideration of ideal models and emblematic memories¹⁸ from the context of Catalan architecture. The form can pass, but poetics no. Still, these are not all of the unwanted similarities de Solà-Morales carefully maneuvers with. One could ask why is it that he criticizes postmodern fundamentalism, which is oriented exactly towards the lessons of modernism and the past in general. The answer lies in the manner of turning to modernism. Rethinking modernism from a different point of view cannot be achieved by strictly returning to modernist fundaments. While *Verwindung* suggests reviving the mistakes of the modernity with a different attitude, proponents of postmodern fundamentalism repeat the identical metaphysical positions in their desire to appropriate the modernist origin. Instead of a weakened relation with the modern tradition, in which modernism is passed on as a message from generation to generation, fundamentalists look at modernism as a solid support in which they find stability and confirm authenticity before the challenges of the plural postmodern age. In this sense, de Solà-Morales reminds that modernity cannot be critically overcome, but that it is also impossible to return to its true origins. However, the rejection of fundamentalism can be made harder by the fact that Rossi's had also represented fragmentariness in his well known typology of urban fragments. Here important is the difference between Rossi's exclusive fragmentariness and de Solà-Morales' advocating inclusive and equivocal fragmentariness.

As concerns Rossi's explicit fundamentalism, de Solà-Morales to some extent got it right with *Verwindung* of modernism. But, when it comes to Frampton's critical regionalism similarities with weak/Catalan architecture are even more problematic and prominent. De Solà-Morales' and Frampton's dispute about Catalan architecture is not a mystery in architectural discourse, even though as a topic, it is marginally covered.¹⁹ In a series of interviews²⁰ and texts²¹, and precisely in Barcelonian *Quaderns*, so to speak on de Solà-Morales' turf, Frampton kept persistently appropriating postmodern Catalan architecture (Pinon, Viaplana, Lilnas, Lapena, Torres) as one of the significant branches of critical regionalism. A theorist such as Frampton, who does not concern himself with fragmentariness and weakness, will in certain architecture find what interests him. Besides, the very formalistic aspects of Catalan architecture cannot prohibit their interpretation in terms of tectonic aspects, vernacular brick tradition or regionalism. On the other hand, by including the greatest stars of critical regionalism (Ando and Siza) in the concept of weak architecture, de Solà-Morales performed an appropriation that is identical to the one Frampton implemented over his Catalan architects.

In addition to the same form, *i.e.*, same architects they favorize, the friction between weak/Catalan architecture and critical regionalism is significant even on a theoretical plane. After de Solà-Morales' premature death, Frampton amicably described their disagreements in terms of affiliation to different schools of theory (neo-marxism and weak thought) and pointed out the shared interest in phenomenology.²² Phenomenological bond of the two theorists cannot be neglected. De Solà-Morales's *decorum* in terms of aesthetic experience as a model for reception of weak/Catalan architecture is not far from Frampton's concern for direct, haptic and corporal experience in critical regionalism which is based on ideas of phenomenology of the body. This is an interesting aspect de Solà-Morales may have had intentionally overlooked, aware that in this regard he would have nothing on Frampton. The attitude towards the phenomenology of place stood out as the main difference. Even though de Solà-Morales appreciates Heidegger's thought, he is not – like Frampton – inclined towards the phenomenology of place; rather, he rejects all that is related to regional and vernacular values as something overly sentimental and romantic. Beyond these seemingly benign theoretical discrepancies, there is, as Nietzsche would call it – will to power, manifested in the two theorists competing for authority over Catalan architecture, *i.e.*, for their own theoretical construct. In this battle de Solà-Morales emphasizes the said main theoretical difference concerning regionalism and the phenomenology of place:

By describing our experience as critical regionalism, Kenneth Frampton unwittingly did us the most backhanded favour possible. The challenge lies in going beyond regionalism, whether this be critical or not, and to find oneself confronted with the metropolitan culture of the advanced Western world.²³

This distinction has not gone unnoticed by the French theorist Jean-Louis Cohen, who concerning Catalan architecture states the following:

Barcelona reveals the contours of a stance which is contemporary and, as a whole, new. It is not the 'critical regionalism' alluded to by Kenneth Frampton. Ignasi de Solà Morales had already done justice to that hasty reading of the specific history of Catalan architecture. Barcelona is more one of the places where what I have called 'critical internationalism' and described as the emergent condition of the end of the 20th century appeared. Rather than a tension over certain picturesque components of regional identity used to produce identity, that stance is based on a great permeability to the outside world.²⁴

Perhaps it is exactly critical internationalism that is the term best fitting de Solà-Morales' profiling of Catalan architects, who keep up-to-date by travelling and reading reviews of current developments, and are familiar in their own way with the architecture of the past, whether that of their own tradition, or someone else's, and can make appropriate use of it when necessary.²⁵ Or, in Vattimo's words, this is listening to messages coming from the past and from others (others alongside us as well as other cultures).²⁶

CONCLUSION:

SPREADING WEAKNESS FROM CATALONIA TO THE WORLD

In spite of de Solà-Morales' rejection of the said postmodern tendencies, it cannot be denied that there is a series of similarities they have with the weak (among other Catalan) architecture. These are the tendencies unified by critical maneuvering in the space between high modernism and stylistic postmodernism, which mostly represent some kind of working with modernism, *i.e.*, revisioning modernism. In this sense, for de Solà-Morales *Verwindung* played a useful role in separating his theoretical construct from the other, competing (either fundamental, typological, tectonic, vernacular or regional) neo-modernisms. Weak/Catalan architecture is represented as a fragmentary and distorted modernism standing opposite the quest for the most authentic modernism and every essentialistically oriented architecture in general. The weak thought is

instrumentalized the way it is in order to underline the difference, *i.e.*, distance between the identity of Catalan architecture from fundamentalism and critical regionalism. In this sense, hidden national ideological implications are hiding behind de Solà-Morales' enthusiasm for Vattimo's philosophy. Consequently, the weak thought is reduced to the by-product of a wish to conquer, preserve and defend authenticity of Catalan architecture.

Paradoxically, identity and authenticity are exactly those metaphysical properties de Solà-Morales allegedly fought against, as someone who thinks in terms of weak thought. His descriptions of Catalan architecture are always carefully balanced in order not to fall into the metaphysical trap. When he says that Catalan architecture has grown into a language with its own character, de Solà-Morales modestly adds that the reasons for this were merely the modernism without overstatement or wise mixture of different components. No matter how much he insisted on representing Barcelona as a city which conscientiously accepts peripheral position of architectural culture compared to the centers, which in those days were New York or Venice, or no matter how he claimed that Catalan architecture is free of universalist prejudice suggesting their solutions are applicable everywhere, de Solà-Morales will in *Arquitectura débil* refute himself. If the initial context of weak thought in *Architettura minimale* was Catalan architecture, in *Arquitectura débil* de Solà-Morales expands this initial context, citing examples from the rest of the world. In terms of the same interpretive models he used to explain architecture locally in Catalonia, he later on colonizes the entire world-wide architectural scene, which is not a negligible transgression for someone who considers himself an advocate of weak thought.

NOTES

- 1 See: Gianni Vattimo, "Dialettica, differenza, pensiero debole," in *Il pensiero debole*, eds. Gianni Vattimo, and Pier Aldo Rovatti (Milano: Feltrinelli, 1983), 12-28.
- 2 Gianni Vattimo, "Introduzione," in *La fine della modernità* (Milano: Garzanti, 1985), 9.
- 3 Gianni Vattimo, "Verwindung: Nihilism and the Postmodern in Philosophy," *SubStance* 16/2 (1987): 12.
- 4 Gianni Vattimo, "Dialectics, difference and weak thought," *Graduate Faculty Philosophy Journal* 10 (1984): 157.
- 5 See: Gianni Vattimo, "Ornamento monumento," in *La fine della modernità* (Milano: Garzanti, 1985), 87-97.; Hans-Georg Gadamer, "The Ontological Foundation of the Occasional and the Decorative," in *Truth and Method* (London: Continuum, 1975), 138-152.
- 6 For how this book resonated in the discourse of minimalism in architecture, see: Vladimir Stevanović, "Ignasi de Solà-Morales and Minimalism" in *European Theories in Former Yugoslavia*, eds. Miško Šuvaković et al. (Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015), 160-166.
- 7 See: Oriol Bohigas, Peter Buchanan and Vittorio M. Lampugnani, *Barcelona: City and Architecture 1980-1992* (New York: Rizzoli, 1991); Joan Busquets, "Barcelona's recovery in the eighties," in *Barcelona: the urban revolution of the compact city* (Cambridge: Harvard Graduate School of Design, 2005), 343-409.
- 8 Ignasi de Solà-Morales, *Architettura minimale a Barcelona: costruire sulla città costruita* (Milano: Electa/ Quaderni di Lotus 5, 1986), 16.
- 9 Ignasi de Solà-Morales, *Architettura minimale*, 19.
- 10 Ignasi de Solà-Morales, "Arquitectura débil," *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 175 (1987): 76.
- 11 See: Martin Heidegger, "Building Dwelling Thinking" and "Poetically Man Dwells," in *Poetry, Language, Thought* (New York: Harper Colophon, 1975), 143-159; 211-227.
- 12 See: Massimo Cacciari, "Eupalinos or Architecture," *Oppositions* 21 (1980): 106-116.
- 13 See: Jean-François Lyotard, "Domus and Megalopolis," in *The Inhuman: Reflections on Time* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1991), 191-204.; Neal Leach, "The Dark Side of the Domus," *The Journal of Architecture* 3/1 (1998): 31-42.
- 14 Ignasi de Solà-Morales, "Arquitectura débil," 84.
- 15 Michael K. Hays, "Ignasi de Solà-Morales: Weak Architecture [1987]" in *Architecture Theory since 1968* (Cambridge & London: The MIT Press, 1998), 614.
- 16 See: Ignasi de Solà-Morales, "Arquitectura débil," in *Diferencias: Topografía de la arquitectura contemporánea* (Barcelona: Editora Gustavo Gili, 1995), 61-78.; Ignasi de Solà-Morales, "Weak Architecture," in *Differences: Topographies of Contemporary Architecture* (Cambridge: The MIT Press, 1997), 57-71.
- 17 Siza's sketch from 1988, showing the building of the Faculty of Architecture in Oporto, is included as an illustration at the beginning of the text *Weak Architecture*, in the English edition of de Solà-Morales's collected essays titled *Differences*. In one of the texts of this book de Solà-Morales speaks of Siza, Gehry and Ando as of the authors who create weak architecture. See: Ignasi de Solà-Morales, "From Autonomy to Untimeliness [1991]," in *Differences: Topographies of Contemporary Architecture* (Cambridge: The MIT Press, 1996), 88.
- 18 Ignasi de Solà-Morales, "Arquitectura Catalana 1990," *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 187 (1990): 43.
- 19 See: Javier Castanon, "Barcelona: City and Architecture 1980-1992; Quaderns d'Arquitectura i Urbanisme nos. 186, 187 and 188/189," *AA Files* 23 (1992): 110-111.
- 20 Pere J. Ravetlatt, "Europa y la continuidad del Proyecto Moderno: Entrevista a Kenneth Frampton," *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 168 (1986): 143.; Wilfred Wang, "America-Europa: Entrevista a Kenneth Frampton," *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 175 (1987): 130.
- 21 See: Kenneth Frampton, "Barcelona 1990: En busca de una línea laconica," *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 187 (1990): 52-63.; Kenneth Frampton, "Sobre la tradició tectónica a la forma Catalana Contemporània," *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 207-209 (1995): 18-27.

- 22 Kenneth Frampton, "In Memoriam Ignasi de Solà-Morales: Una reflexió sobre las diferencias," in *Teorías de la arquitectura: memorial Ignasi de Solà-Morales*, eds. Josep Maria Montaner and Fabián Gabriel Pérez (Barcelona: Edicions de la Universitat Politècnica de Catalunya, 2003), 19.
- 23 Ignasi de Solà-Morales, "Arquitectura Catalana 1990," 45.
- 24 Jean-Louis Cohen, "L'enseignement de Barcelone: vingt ans de projets urbains et leur réception," *Projet urbain* 14 (1998): 26.
- 25 Ignasi de Solà-Morales, *Architettura minimale a Barcelona: costruire sulla città costruita*, 16.
- 26 Gianni Vattimo, "Dialectics, difference and weak thought," 157.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Bohigas, Oriol, Peter Buchanan and Vittorio M. Lampugnani. *Barcelona: City and Architecture 1980-1992*. New York: Rizolli, 1991.
- Busquets, Joan. *Barcelona: the urban revolution of the compact city*. Cambridge: Harvard Graduate School of Design, 2005.
- Cacciari, Massimo. "Eupalinos or Architecture." *Oppositions* 21 (1980): 106-116.
- Castanon, Javier. "Barcelona: City and Architecture 1980-1992; Quaderns d'Arquitectura i Urbanisme nos. 186, 187 and 188/189." *AA Files* 23 (1992): 110-111.
- Cohen, Jean-Louis. "L'enseignement de Barcelone: vingt ans de projets urbains et leur réception." *Projet urbain* 14 (1998): 25-27.
- de Solà-Morales, Ignasi. *Architettura minimale a Barcelona: costruire sulla città costruita*. Milano: Electa/ Quaderni di Lotus 5, 1986.
- de Solà-Morales, Ignasi. "Arquitectura débil." *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 175 (1987): 74-85.
- de Solà-Morales, Ignasi. "Arquitectura Catalana 1900." *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 187 (1990): 40-51.
- de Solà-Morales, Ignasi. *Diferencias: Topografía de la arquitectura contemporánea*. Barcelona: Editora Gustavo Gili, 1995.
- de Solà-Morales, Ignasi. *Differences: Topographies of Contemporary Architecture*. Cambridge: The MIT Press, 1996.
- Frampton, Kenneth. "Barcelona 1990: En busca de una línea laconica." *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 187 (1990): 52-63.
- Frampton, Kenneth. "Sobre la tradició tectónica a la forma Catalana Contemporània." *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 207-209 (1995): 18-27.
- Frampton, Kenneth. "In Memoriam Ignasi de Solà-Morales: Una reflexió sobre las diferencias." in *Teorías de la arquitectura: memorial Ignasi de Solà-Morales*, edited by J.M.Montaner and F. G.Pérez, 19-22. Barcelona: Edicions de la Universitat Politècnica de Catalunya, 2003.
- Gadamer, Hans-Georg. *Truth and Method*. London: Continuum, 1975.
- Hays, K. Michael. "Ignasi de Solà-Morales: Weak Architecture." in *Architecture Theory since 1968*, 614-615. Cambridge & London: The MIT Press, 1998.
- Heidegger, Martin. *Poetry, Language, Thought*. New York: Harper Colophon, 1975.
- Leach, Neal. "The Dark Side of the Domus." *The Journal of Architecture* 3/1 (1998): 31-42.
- Liotard, Jean-François. *The Inhuman: Reflections on Time*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 1991.
- Ravetlatt, J. Pere. "Europa y la continuidad del Proyecto Moderno: Entrevista a Kenneth Frampton." *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 168 (1986): 142-147.
- Stevanović, Vladimir. "Ignasi de Solà-Morales and Minimalism." in *European Theories in Former Yugoslavia*, edited by M.Šuvaković et al., 160-166. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015.
- Vattimo, Gianni, Pier Aldo Rovatti. *Il pensiero debole*. Milano: Feltrinelli, 1983.
- Vattimo, Gianni. "Dialectics, difference and weak thought." *Graduate Faculty Philosophy Journal* 10 (1984): 151-164.
- Vattimo, Gianni. *La fine della modernità*. Milano: Garzanti, 1985.
- Vattimo, Gianni. "Verwindung: Nihilism and the Postmodern in Philosophy." *SubStance* 16/2 (1987): 7-17.
- Wang, Wilfred. "America-Europa: Entrevista a Kenneth Frampton." *Quaderns d'Arquitectura I Urbanisme* 175 (1987): 126-135.

ETIKA STANOVANJA: RANI HRIŠĆANSKI PRINCIPI GRADSKOG ŽIVOTA I URBANE TRANSFORMACIJE

Vladimir Mako

Rad se fokusira na određeno pitanje u vezi etike koja se razvila u ranom hrišćanskom vremenu i njenog uticaja na proces transformacije rimskog urbanog života, navika, funkcije i arhitektonske prakse krajem petog veka i nakon toga.

Složenost ovog pitanja proizilazi iz činjenice da su rani hrišćanski monaški ideali, koji su se brzo razvili u prvim vekovima nove ere, značajno uticali na formiranje svakodnevnih životnih etičkih principa.

Shodno tome, ovi novi principi su promenili postojeće navike u stanovanju, posebno u oblasti javnog života, zahtevajući novi oblik ponašanja od hrišćanskih građana. Ovaj proces je uticao i na idealistički pogled na ono što koncept hrišćanskog grada može biti, i kako se novi oblik etičkog života odražava na nove urbane i arhitektonske strukture.

KLJUČNE REČI: ETIKA, ESTETIKA, GRADSKI ŽIVOT, URBANA TRANSFORMACIJA

UMETNOST, MODERNOST I SKEPTICIZAM

Nikola Dedić

Ovaj rad se bavi problemom odnosa umetnosti i modernosti - naša osnovna teza je da se umetnik u eri modernosti bavi problemom privatnosti. Pojam privatnosti se koristi u Vitgenštajnovom smislu, kao analogija njegovoj teoretizaciji fantazije privatnog jezika. Njegov koncept privatnog jezika je opis povlačenja običnog jezika iz procesa međudruštvenih odnosa i njegove svakodnevne upotrebe; na taj način, fantazija privatnog jezika je vrsta skepticizma. S obzirom na to da je pojam epistemološkog skepticizma povezan sa idejom modernosti (Dekartov, Hjumov, Lokov moderni skeptični predmet), glavni problem za savremenog umetnika je kako da prevaziđe stanje radikalnog skepticizma, odnosno uslov koji Stenli Kavel u Vitgenštajnovom smislu naziva 'metafizička izolacija'.

KLJUČNE REČI: UMETNOST, MODERNOST, SKEPTICIZAM, PRIVATNI JEZIK, OBIČAN JEZIK, LUDVIG VITGENŠTAJN, STENLI KAVEL

OD TRANSCENDENTALNOG IDEALIZMA DO TRANSCENDENTALNOG EMPIRIZMA I ŠIRE: KANT, DELEZ I RAVNA ONTOLOGIJA UMETNOSTI

Andrija Filipović

U ovom radu ću pokazati da pokret od Kantovog transcendentalnog idealizma do Žil Delezovog transcendentalnog empirizma, a zatim do novih materializma i spekulativnih realizma je ono što nam omogućava da razgovaramo o direktnom i ne-posredovanom pristupu stvari u sebi (ili njenom raspadanju). Drugim rečima, to je promena od uslova mogućeg iskustva do uslova realnog iskustva koja su omogućila trenutne filozofske i teorijske diskurse materializma i realizma. Ono što je od posebnog interesa za potrebe ovog rada je kako je promena od uslova mogućeg do stvarnog iskustva povezana sa trenutnom konceptualizacijom umetničkih praksi. Tačnije, ja ću pokazati kako se ontologija umetnosti promenila, ili barem da se možda čini da postoji mogućnost premeštanja paradigme različitih estetika i ontologija umetnosti, gde je ravna ontologija jedna od njih, sa pojavom novih materializma i spekulativnih realizma koji su omogućeni promenom u uslovima realnog iskustva.

KLJUČNE REČI: TRANSCENDENTALNI IDEALIZAM, TRANSCENDENTALNI EMPIRIZAM, RAVNA ONTOLOGIJA, UMETNOST, KANT, DELEZ

IMPLIKACIJE VATIMOVOG *VERWINDUNG*-A MODERNIZMA U ARHITEKTONSKOJ TEORIJI

Vladimir Stevanović

U postmodernom dobu, osim novog pristupa arhitektonskoj praksi, dešavaju se značajne promene u bavljenju arhitektonskim pisanjem i to zahvaljujući uplivu postmoderne transdisciplinarnе teorije u arhitektonski diskurs. Arhitektonski teoretičari, kritičari i istoričari rado koriste doprinos

filozofije, političkih nauka, sociologije, teorije umetnosti i književne kritike na polju kategorizacije i interpretacije postmodernih arhitektonskih stilova ili tendencija. Kako formalno-likovni aspekti prestaju da budu ekskluzivni faktor koji konstituiše stil ili tendenciju, dolazi do implementacije tema i paradigmi iz raznih postmodernih teorija, što dovodi do fenomena prevođenja teorije za arhitektonske potrebe. U većini slučajeva teorijski nazori služe kao pokriće u skladu sa kojim teoretičari arhitekture formulišu autorske poetike određenih arhitekata, proglašavaju poželjne modele recepcije njihovih arhitektonskih dela, i formiraju ukupne stavove prema disciplinarnom i društveno-istorijskom kontekstu. Međutim, postaje interesantno kada ista arhitektonska dela jednog ili više arhitekata bivaju na različite načine interpretirana od strane različitih arhitektonskih teoretičara. U tom smislu, rad sagledava ove premise na konkretnom primeru (1) u kome praksu čini Katalonska arhitektura osamdesetih, (2) u kome se ukrštaju ideje de Solà-Moralesa, Rosija i Fremptona, (3) a teorijski obrazac na koji se može fokusirati je Vatimov filozofski koncept *Verwindung*-a modernizma.

KLJUČNE REČI: *VERWINDUNG*, SLABA MISAO, MODERNIZAM, POSTMODERNIZAM, FUNDAMENTALIZAM, FRAGMENTARNOST

PITANJE PREDSTAVLJANJA I IDENTITETA IZMEĐU GLOBALIZMA I LOKALIZMA: SLUČAJ PAVILJONA HONG KONGA NA VENECIJANSKOM BIJENALU

Eva Kit Vah Man

Ovaj rad uzima umetničku instalaciju Li Kita izloženu u paviljonu Hong Konga na Bijenalu u Veneciji 2013. godine, kao studiju slučaja da ilustruje načine na koje dela nude i pomažu sačinjavanje izazvanog Hong Konga i subverziju agresivne i moćno rastuću Kine. Za razliku od 'očigledne' društvene kritike i 'grandioznog' izgleda umetničkih dela izloženih u kineskom paviljonu, Li Kitova umetnička instalacija – "impresionistička kuća" – u Hong Kongovom paviljonu ne samo da izgleda apstraktno, već i svetovno i čak i trivijalno. Pošto je umetnik bio izabran od strane organizatora bez učešća javnosti, ovo je generisalo žestoku javnu raspravu o reprezentativnosti 'Hongkongnosti' ove instalacije. Moja tvrdnja je da je ono što se čini trivijalnim i običnim u Lijevom radu predstavljeno da konstituiše, a ne prikaže, umetnost nove generacije Hong Konga. To takođe može biti taktika manevrisanja političkim identitetom koji je nametnula Kina Hong Kongu svojim sveprisutnim i pritiskajućim prisustvom. Umetnost Hong Konga ima potencijal da se udalji ili da sumnja u velike narative Kine, da parafraziram reči istoričara umetnosti Dejvida Klarka (1997). Verujem da je motiv međunarodne konferencije "Hong Kong kao metod" decembra 2014. na Univerzitetu u Hong Kongu bio da upotrebom očekivanog destabilizuje i ospori hongkonški "zdravo-za-gotovo" politički identitet i na taj način promovise raznolikosti i međuazijsku kulturnu dinamiku.

KLJUČNE REČI: UMETNOST INSTALACIJA, HONGKONGNOST, KINESKOST, POLITIKA IDENTITETA, GLOBALIZAM

SAVREMENA KINESKA UMETNOST: MAOVO NASLEĐE I DANTOOVA DEFINICIJA

Mary Bittner Wiseman

U ovom radu pokušala sam da izvedem tri stvari. Kao prvo, da identifikujem nekoliko tema u savremenoj kineskoj umetnosti kroz koje pokazuje svoju suštinski *socijalna* prirodu i svoj robustan *materijalizam*, karakteristike kojih nema često u zapadnoj umetnosti. Drugo, da ukažem na način na koji je savremena umetnost u Kini postmoderna jete način na koji je i zapadna umetnost, i da potkrepim tvrdnju da koliko god da su teme i nedavna istorija ove umetnosti drugačije od zapadnog pandana, ova umetnost zadovoljava definiciju umetnosti koju je konstruisao Artur Danto, a to je ona koja na fino zaokružuje i širinu i dubinu koncepta umetnosti. Konačno, u poslednjem delu, predstavicu rad jedne žene-umetnika koji se razlikuje od većine skorašnjih kineskih radova i tipičnih radova zapadne umetnost. On se pozicionira na marginama onoga što je umetnost u Kini i što Dantoova definicija obuhvata, istovremeno sugerišući srž umetničke prakse i jedan od načina biti žena.

KLJUČNE REČI: SAVREMENA KINESKA UMETNOST, ZAPAD, ARTUR DANTO, KRAJ UMETNOSTI